

“Cache”

Resource Summary: A Smarter Balanced (CAASPP) English/Language Arts practice writing test, using *West of the West’s Cache* as a video source, along with two other print resources. Students will be asked to complete a task in which they will write an opinion paper that states whether The Lone Women of San Nicholas’ Island’s cave should be excavated or left untouched.

Subject Areas: English Language Arts & Social Studies

Grade Level Range: 4-5

Standards: CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.4.RI.10 By the end of year, read and comprehend informational texts, including history/social studies, science, and technical texts, in grades 4-5 text complexity band proficiency, with scaffolding as needed at the high end of the range. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.4.RI.2 Determine the main idea of a text and explain how it is supported by key details; summarizes the text. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.4.RI.3 Explain events, procedures, ideas, or concepts in a historical, scientific, or technical text, including what happened and why, based on specific information in the text. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.4.W.1 Write opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons and information. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.5.RI.10 By the end of the year, read and comprehend informational texts, including history/social studies, science, and technical texts, at the high end of the grades 4-5 text complexity band independently and proficiently. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.5.RI.2 Determine two or more main ideas of a text and explain how they are supported by key details; summarize the text. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.5.RI.3 Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.5.RI.3 Explain the relationships or interaction between two or more individuals, events, ideas, or concepts in a historical, scientific, or technical text based on specific information in the text. CCSS.ELA- LITERACY.5.W.1 Write opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons and information.

Resource Provided By: Nichole Hughes, 4th/5th Grade, Summerland Elementary School, Carpinteria Unified School District

Resource Details: An archeologist visited a student’s class. As a result, their class has decided to do further research on the archeological findings of The Lone Woman of San Nicholas’ cave. This student has found three sources about this topic in the school library. After the student has looked at these sources, they will answer some questions about them.

The student will then write an opinion paper that will be given to your teacher about whether you agree with the cave’s excavation, or whether you disagree with the excavation. The article will be read by other students and your teacher.

West of the West “Cache” English/Language Arts Practice Grade 4-5 Performance Task

Student Directions- San Nicholas Island Cave Excavation Performance Task

Task:

An archeologist from San Nicholas Channel Island visited your class today to discuss his occupation for career week. You and your classmates became interested in learning more about the archeological discovery of The Lone Woman’s cave on San Nicholas Channel Island. Your teacher took your class to the school library to look up more information about this topic. You have found three sources about the archeological cave discovery on San Nicholas Island.

After you have looked at these sources, you will answer some questions about them. Briefly review the sources and the three questions that follow. Then, go back and read the sources carefully so you will have the information you will need to answer the questions and complete your research. You may take notes on the information you find in the sources as you read.

In Part 2, you will write an opinion paper on a topic related to the sources.

Directions for Beginning:

You will now examine several sources. You can re-examine any of the sources as often as you like.

Research Questions:

After reviewing the research sources, use the rest of the time in Part 1 to answer three questions about them. Your answers to these questions will be scored. Also, your answers will help you think about the information you have read, which should help you write your opinion paper.

You may refer back to your notes when you think it would be helpful. Answer the questions on a separate sheet of paper.

Your notes will be available to you in Part 1 and Part 2 of the performance task.

Part 1

Sources for Performance Task

Source #1

You have found a current article about the cave on San Nicholas Island on the *Los Angeles Times* website. The author is a public service staff writer for the L.A. Times who was a finalist in the 2015 Pulitzer Prize for breaking news.

With Island Dig Halted, Lone Woman Still A Stinging Mystery

By Louis Sahagun

For months they worked together to reveal details of the cave where the Lone Woman of San Nicolas Island may have lived, painstakingly removing bucket after bucket of sand — 40,000 in all.

Navy archaeologist Steve Schwartz, who was helping lead the project, was impressed by one of the Cal State L.A. students taking part in the high-profile dig: Tom Holm, a filmmaker who was eager to weave the team's archaeology lessons into a documentary based on the work. And Holm felt blessed to work shoulder-to-shoulder with experts, marveling at their knowledge of the 19th century Native American woman who survived on the Channel island for 18 years, abandoned and alone.

In April 2012, they were inches away from relics that would flesh out the real-life story of the woman who inspired the novel "Island of the Blue Dolphins," one of the 20th century's most popular novels for young readers and required reading in many California schools.

But commanders at the naval base on the island about 65 miles southwest of Point Mugu ordered Schwartz to halt the dig. The archaeologist was especially dismayed by a terse question embedded in the order: "Is the work you're doing out there legal?"



Archaeologist Steve Schwartz felt betrayed when the Navy ordered a halt to work at a site it took him 20 years to find: the cave believed to be the home of a 19th century Native American woman who lived on San Nicolas Island, abandoned and alone, for 18 years.

But something else stung. The shutdown grew out of allegations by none other than Holm, who had brought members of the Pechanga tribe to the island amid concerns that work in and around the cave was possibly out of compliance with federal laws enacted to protect cultural resources.

The closure interrupted research on one of the most significant historical finds in California history — and led Schwartz, 57, to retire early in anger and frustration. "It's a heartbreak. A travesty," Schwartz said on a recent weekday. "We may never learn what archaeological riches that cave is guarding."

Very little is known about the Nicoleno Indians, who in the early 1800s suffered catastrophic losses in repeated fights with Russian fur traders and Alaskan sea otter hunters over pelts and native women. The Nicoleno population of about 300 dropped sharply to a few dozen after a particularly brutal battle in 1814.

In 1835, a ship was dispatched by Franciscan fathers to bring to San Pedro the few who remained. All but one made the trip aboard the *Peores Nada*, loosely translated as "better than nothing."

According to legend, the woman jumped overboard and swam for shore after realizing that her baby had been left behind. A sudden storm forced the ship's captain to shove off without her. Legend has it that as she was running back home, the baby was eaten by wild dogs. "What actually happened to her remains a mystery," Schwartz said. He was determined to find out.

Schwartz had already spent more than 20 years searching for the cave when, in 2012, its precise location was confirmed in the field notes and compass bearings of a 19th century government surveyor. One of his field stations on the island, the surveyor wrote, was "100 yards eastward of the large cave formerly inhabited by a wild Indian woman who lived there alone for 18 years."

Schwartz discovered the cave — 20 feet high, 75 feet long and packed with sand — under a rock overhang. Digging out the sand, Schwartz and his team uncovered two sets of initials and a date etched near the cave's arching mouth: "September 11, 1911." They also found two glass pepper sauce bottles, remnants of late 19th century seamen. At first, Holm was excited to be taking part in the dig, led by Schwartz and Rene Vellanoweth, Holm's archaeology professor at Cal State L.A.

But Holm's views began to change after meetings with Pechanga elders who questioned his instructors' explanations of artifacts unearthed on the island. Holm also fumed over T-shirts worn by Vellanoweth and his team members that said "San Nicolas Cave Archaeology," because, as he put it, "we did not have permission to do anything other than remove sand."

Later, teams of archaeology students were stunned by heated exchanges between Holm and Schwartz and Vellanoweth in the cave and elsewhere on the island.

After stewing over the perceived violations for months, Holm invited three members of the Pechanga Band of Luiseno Indians to accompany him on a tour of the cave. A few weeks later, the tribe, best known for its lucrative casino near the Riverside County city of Temecula, fired off letters demanding that the Navy stop archaeological research in the cave and at 549 other sites across the island.

Now, the cave is closed indefinitely while its fate is being negotiated between the Navy and the Pechanga tribe, which is claiming cultural affiliation with the island's mysterious ancient people, who for 8,000 years scratched out a living eating mostly shellfish, sea lions, small fish and roots.

"We're only trying to do what's right by our ancestors," Mark Macarro, the tribe's chairman, said in an interview. "We must ensure that all applicable federal laws are followed."

As a rule, when it comes to digging up artifacts, the Pechanga's preference is avoidance.

Federal agencies are required to consult with a federally recognized tribe before undertaking a proposal that may adversely affect cultural resources it is affiliated with. The Pechanga aims to assume that role.

The tribe hinges its claim on its interpretation of the only four words uttered by the Lone Woman that were written down, and two songs she reportedly sang, after she was finally brought from the island to Santa Barbara.

No one understood a word of the Lone Woman's language beyond that she called a hide "tocah," a man "nache," the sky "toygwah" and the body "puoochay," according to badly spelled transcriptions made under unknown conditions by unidentified non-linguists. Her songs are mostly "vocables," or nonsense syllables.

Many archaeologists who are knowledgeable about the earliest inhabitants of the Channel Islands say a preponderance of skeletal and DNA data affiliates the island with Gabrielino Tongva Indians, who occupied the greater Los Angeles Basin and the southern three islands: Santa Catalina, San Clemente and San Nicolas.

Among them is John Johnson, curator of anthropology at the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. "Granting cultural affiliation with Pechanga would be a big mistake," he said. "I don't believe it would survive a legal challenge. The four words do not indicate some sort of cultural connection."

Last week, however, the Navy announced it had determined that the Pechanga were culturally affiliated with the remains of 469 people and 436 objects that have been removed from San Nicolas Island and are now stored in museum and university collections throughout the state.

The designation, which does not specifically apply to the cave, is expected to give the tribe a greater role in determining the extent of future archaeological research on the island. The tribe says it has not yet decided what to do with the artifacts.

Among the losers in the dig shutdown is Holm himself, who says he invested \$100,000 in a film project that may never be completed.

Holm, 53, said he didn't know that bringing Pechanga tribal members to San Nicolas would stir up a "wasps' nest." But he says he believes the Navy made the right decision. As for his role in the end of Schwartz's 25-year career as a Navy archaeologist, Holm said: "He should be happy because he got to discover the cave. At some point in every man's life, he must hand over his work to the next generation."

"That's ridiculous," Schwartz said, shaking his head in disappointment. "If the Navy hadn't stopped us, I'd still be out there continuing the research."

For now, at least, the mystery of the Lone Woman of San Nicolas Island will remain unsolved.

In the years after she was left behind, fishermen occasionally reported seeing a figure running along the deserted island's wind-raked beaches.

In 1853, the woman — strong, of medium height and about 50 years old — was skinning a seal and living in a nearby cave when she was found by Santa Barbara fur traders.

She sailed to Santa Barbara on their vessel. She died seven weeks later of dysentery. On her deathbed, she was baptized and named Juana Maria.

She is buried at the Santa Barbara Mission. One hundred and sixty-two years after her death, she remains as alone and mysterious as ever.

Source Used

<http://www.latimes.com/local/great-reads/la-me-c1-cave-artifacts-20150305-story.html>

Source #2

You have found an article about the cave on San Nicholas Island in an October 29th, 2012 issue of the Los Angeles Times newspaper.

'Island of the Blue Dolphins' Woman's Cave Believed Found

By Steve Chawkins

The yellowing government survey map of San Nicolas Island dated from 1879, but it was quite clear: There was a big black dot on the southwest coast and, next to it, the words "Indian Cave."

For more than 20 years, Navy archaeologist Steve Schwartz searched for that cave. It was believed to be home to the island's most famous inhabitant, a Native American

woman who survived on the island for 18 years, abandoned and alone, and became the inspiration for "Island of the Blue Dolphins," one of the 20th century's most popular novels for young readers.

The problem for Schwartz was that San Nicolas, a wind-raked, 22-square-mile chunk of sandstone and scrub, has few caves, all of them dank, wet hollows where the tides surge in and nobody could live for long.

Year after year, he scoured the beaches and cliffs, drilled exploratory holes, checked the old map, pored over contemporary accounts and conferred with other experts, all in vain. If he could find the cave, he could find artifacts — clues that would flesh out the real-life story that inspired Scott O'Dell to pen the 1960 novel that won the Newbery Medal and became required reading in many California schools. More than 6.5 million copies are in print and teachers frequently assign it between the fourth and seventh grades.

If he found the cave, he might solve mysteries about the "Lone Woman of San Nicolas" and her Nicoleño tribe, which was left devastated by a massacre in 1814 by sea otter hunters from Alaska.

With the help of recently unearthed notes written in a fine script by a 19th century government surveyor, Schwartz now believes he's found it.

"We're 90% sure this is the Lone Woman's cave," Schwartz told several hundred fellow researchers last week at the California Islands Symposium in Ventura. Further excavation is necessary, he said, adding that a crew of students has painstakingly removed about 40,000 buckets, or a million pounds, of sand from a cavern at least 75 feet long and 10 feet high.

In a separate discovery that also could shed light on the Lone Woman and her people, researchers stumbled across two redwood boxes poking through a steep, eroding cliff. The containers, probably made from recycled canoe planks and held together with the tar that washes onto island beaches, hold more than 200 stone blades, harpoon points, bone fishhooks and other implements.

"We find amazing stuff every time we go to the Channel Islands, and this may be the most amazing find of all," said Jon M. Erlandson, a University of Oregon archaeologist who has explored the islands for more than 30 years.

It may never be known just who left the cache of tools, he said, but "it's at least a reasonable hypothesis" that it was the Lone Woman, who is known to have stashed useful items at a number of places around the island.

About 60 miles off the coast, San Nicolas is a lonely Navy base dotted with installations designed to track missiles. It also has more than 540 known archaeological sites, some with evidence that people have lived on the island for more than 8,000 years.

For many Nicoleños, life ended in the early 1800s. Russian fur traders brought groups of Alaskan sea otter hunters to San Nicolas, where they engaged in repeated fights with native men over women and furs. The Nicoleño population dwindled from perhaps 300 to a few dozen, dropping most sharply after a particularly savage battle in 1814.

By 1835, the few Nicoleños left were struggling. Whether motivated by compassion or a need to increase the ranks of mission laborers, Franciscan fathers from the mainland sent a ship for them. All but one made the trip to the mainland aboard the *Peor es Nada*, loosely translated as "Better than nothing."

The holdout came to be known as the Lone Woman. According to legend, she jumped overboard and swam for shore when she frantically realized that her baby had been left behind. Less romanticized theories hold that she told the captain she'd show up with her child but a sudden storm forced him to shove off without her.

What's known is that a solitary woman lived in the sand and fog of San Nicolas for the next 18 years. On the mainland, her legend grew. A time or two, fishermen reported seeing a fleeting figure on the deserted island. In 1850, a padre at the Santa Barbara Mission commissioned a sea captain to find her.

The captain sailed to the island but found nothing to indicate the woman was still alive. However, his account of the plentiful seals and sea otters piqued the interest of George Nidever, a Santa Barbara rancher and fur trader. In 1852, Nidever found footprints on the beach. The next year, he found the Lone Woman.

"The old woman was of medium height but rather thick," he later reported. "She must have been about 50 years old but she was still strong and active. Her face was pleasing, as she was continuously smiling. Her teeth were entire but worn to the gums."

Source Used

<http://articles.latimes.com/2012/oct/29/local/la-me-lone-woman-cave-20121027>

Source #3

This tale from a documentary about the Channel Islands described the Lone Woman's chest and artifacts that were found by a team of archeologists on San Nicholas Island. The speakers include Steve Schwartz, a Navy archeologist and two university archeological professors.

Watch the "Cache" tale from the *West of the West* documentary.

Questions:

1. What is the main idea or ideas of each source? Some sources may have more than one main idea.

2. The sources discuss how archeologists knew they had discovered the Lone Woman's artifacts. Use **one** detail from Source #1 or Source #2, and **one** detail from Source #3 to support your explanation. For each detail, include the source title or number.
3. Which source would **most likely** be the most helpful in understanding the skills needed to become an archeologist? Explain why this source is **most likely** the most helpful. Give at least **two** details from the source to support your answer.

Student Directions-

San Nicholas Island Cave Excavation Performance Task

Part 2

You will now review your notes and sources, and plan, draft, revise, and edit your writing. You may use your notes and go back to the sources. Now read your assignment and information about how your writing will be scored, then begin your work.

Your Assignment:

When your class returns from the library, your classmates begin to share what they learned about being an archeologist on the discovery of the Lone Woman's cave. They also begin to discuss the rules that allow archeologists to excavate or leave be the artifacts of Native Americans. Some students agree with the rules, and some students disagree with the rules. Your teacher asks you to write a paper explaining your opinion about the rules.

In your paper, you will take a side as to whether you agree that the archeologists should be able to excavate and study the artifacts of the Lone Woman, or whether you disagree and believe the rule that all Native American artifacts should be left alone. Your paper will be read by your teacher and your classmates. Make sure you clearly state your opinion with reasons and details from the sources. Develop your ideas clearly and use your own words, except when quoting directly from the sources. Be sure to give the source title or number for the details or facts you use.

REMEMBER: A well-written opinion paper:

- Has a clear, main opinion.
- Is well organized and stays on topic.
- Has an introduction and conclusion.
- Uses transitions.
- Uses details from the sources to support your opinion.
- Puts the information from the sources in your own words, except when using direct quotations from the sources.
- Gives the title or number of the source for the details or facts you included.
- Develops ideas clearly.
- Uses clear language.
- Follows rules of writing (spelling, punctuation, and grammar).

Now begin work on your opinion paper. Manage your time carefully so that you can:

1. Plan your opinion paper.
2. Write your opinion paper.
3. Revise and edit the final draft of your opinion paper.

Word-processing tools and spell check are available to you.

For Part 2, you are being asked to write an opinion paper that is several paragraphs long. Type your response.

Remember to check your notes and your pre-writing/planning as you write and then revise and edit your opinion paper.

Smarter Balanced Grade 5 Opinion Writing Rubric:

Grade 5

4-Point Opinion Performance Task Writing Rubric (Grades 3-5)					
Score	4	3	2	1	NS
Organization/Purpose	<p>The response has a clear and effective organizational structure, creating a sense of unity and completeness. The organization is sustained between and within paragraphs. The response is consistently and purposefully focused:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • opinion is introduced, clearly communicated, and the focus is strongly maintained for the purpose and audience • consistent use of a variety of transitional strategies to clarify the relationships between and among ideas • effective introduction and conclusion • logical progression of ideas from beginning to end; strong connections between and among ideas with some syntactic variety 	<p>The response has an evident organizational structure and a sense of completeness. Though there may be minor flaws, they do not interfere with the overall coherence. The organization is adequately sustained between and within paragraphs. The response is generally focused:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • opinion is clear, and the focus is mostly maintained for the purpose and audience • adequate use of transitional strategies with some variety to clarify relationships between and among ideas • adequate introduction and conclusion • adequate progression of ideas from beginning to end; adequate connections between and among ideas 	<p>The response has an inconsistent organizational structure. Some flaws are evident, and some ideas may be loosely connected. The organization is somewhat sustained between and within paragraphs. The response may have a minor drift in focus:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • opinion may be somewhat unclear, or the focus may be insufficiently sustained for the purpose and/or audience • inconsistent use of transitional strategies and/or little variety • introduction or conclusion, if present, may be weak • uneven progression of ideas from beginning to end; and/or formulaic; inconsistent or unclear connections between and among ideas 	<p>The response has little or no discernible organizational structure. The response may be related to the opinion but may provide little or no focus:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • opinion may be confusing or ambiguous; response may be too brief or the focus may drift from the purpose and/or audience • few or no transitional strategies are evident • introduction and/or conclusion may be missing • frequent extraneous ideas may be evident; ideas may be randomly ordered or have an unclear progression 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Insufficient (includes copied text) • In a language other than English • Off-topic • Off-purpose

20

4-Point Opinion Performance Task Writing Rubric (Grades 3–5)					
Score	4	3	2	1	NS
Evidence/Elaboration	<p>The response provides thorough and convincing elaboration of the support/evidence for the opinion and supporting idea(s) that includes the effective use of source material. The response clearly and effectively develops ideas, using precise language:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> comprehensive evidence (facts and details) from the source material is integrated, relevant, and specific clear citations or attribution of source material effective use of a variety of elaborative techniques* vocabulary is clearly appropriate for the audience and purpose effective, appropriate style enhances content 	<p>The response provides adequate elaboration of the support/evidence for the opinion and supporting idea(s) that includes the use of source material. The response adequately develops ideas, employing a mix of precise with more general language:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> adequate evidence (facts and details) from the source material is integrated and relevant, yet may be general adequate use of citations or attribution to source material adequate use of some elaborative techniques* vocabulary is generally appropriate for the audience and purpose generally appropriate style is evident 	<p>The response provides uneven, cursory elaboration of the support/evidence for the opinion and supporting idea(s) that includes partial or uneven use of source material. The response develops ideas unevenly, using simplistic language:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> some evidence (facts and details) from the source material may be weakly integrated, imprecise, repetitive, vague, and/or copied weak use of citations or attribution to source material weak or uneven use of elaborative techniques*; development may consist primarily of source summary vocabulary use is uneven or somewhat ineffective for the audience and purpose inconsistent or weak attempt to create appropriate style 	<p>The response provides minimal elaboration of the support/evidence for the opinion and supporting idea(s) that includes little or no use of source material. The response is vague, lacks clarity, or is confusing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> evidence (facts and details) from the source material is minimal, irrelevant, absent, incorrectly used, or predominantly copied insufficient use of citations or attribution to source material minimal, if any, use of elaborative techniques* vocabulary is limited or ineffective for the audience and purpose little or no evidence of appropriate style 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Insufficient (includes copied text) In a language other than English Off-topic Off-purpose

*Elaborative techniques may include the use of personal experiences that support the opinion.

2-Point Opinion Performance Task Writing Rubric (Grades 3–5)				
Score	2	1	0	NS
Conventions	<p>The response demonstrates an adequate command of conventions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> adequate use of correct sentence formation, punctuation, capitalization, grammar usage, and spelling 	<p>The response demonstrates a partial command of conventions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> limited use of correct sentence formation, punctuation, capitalization, grammar usage, and spelling 	<p>The response demonstrates little or no command of conventions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> infrequent use of correct sentence formation, punctuation, capitalization, grammar usage, and spelling 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Insufficient (includes copied text) In a language other than English Off-topic Off-purpose

Holistic Scoring:

- **Variety:** A range of errors includes sentence formation, punctuation, capitalization, grammar usage, and spelling.
- **Severity:** Basic errors are more heavily weighted than higher-level errors.
- **Density:** The proportion of errors to the amount of writing done well. This includes the ratio of errors to the length of the piece.

Source Used

http://www.caaspp.org/rsc/resources/2016_Grade5ELAPerformanceTask_BraillePerformanceTask.pdf

Additional Resources:

<http://articles.latimes.com/2012/oct/29/local/la-me-lone-woman-cave-20121027>

<http://www.latimes.com/local/great-reads/la-me-c1-cave-artifacts-20150305-story.html>

http://www.caaspp.org/rsc/resources/2016_Grade5ELAPerformanceTask_BraillePerformanceTask.pdf